

## NORTH YORKSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### SCRUTINY OF HEALTH COMMITTEE

Minutes of the meeting held at St Augustine's Church Hall, Kirkby Lane, Kirkby in Cleveland on 19 November 2010.

#### PRESENT:-

County Councillor Jim Clark (Chairman).

County Councillors:- Val Arnold, John Blackie, Andrew Backhouse, John Clark, Polly English, Margaret Hulme, Michael Knaggs, Shelagh Marshall, John McCartney, Heather Moorhouse, and Chris Pearson.

District Council Members: - John Roberts (Substitute for Helen Firth Craven), Shirley Shepherd (Hambleton), Ian Galloway (Harrogate) and Rob Johnson (Richmondshire), Eileen Vickers (Scarborough) and Kay McSherry (substitute for Ruth Sayner Selby).

Officers: Bryon Hunter (Scrutiny Support), Jane Wilkinson and Lee Humphreys (Legal and Democratic Services).

Present by Invitation:

NHS North Yorkshire and York - Graham Purdy and Lorraine Naylor.

Yorkshire Ambulance Service - Vince Larvin and Helen Hugill.

Posterngate Surgery – Dr Reid and Jacqueline Roe.

Bannatynes Surgery – Jennifer Joyce.

South Tees Hospital NHS Foundation Trust – Jill Moulton and Dr P McCann.

In attendance:-

Hambleton District Council - Councillors Margaret Skillbeck and Bridget Fortune.

Ryedale District Council – Councillor Natalie Warriner.

Richmondshire District Council – Councillor Tony Duff.

NY LINK – Kath Murray.

Apologies were received from County Councillor Andrew Goss and District Councillors Helen Firth (Craven) and Ruth Sayner (Selby).

One member of the public.

---

**COPIES OF ALL DOCUMENTS CONSIDERED ARE IN THE MINUTE BOOK**

---

#### **54. MINUTES**

##### **RESOLVED -**

That the Minutes of the meeting held on 15 October 2010 be taken as read and be confirmed and signed by the Chairman as a correct record subject to the following amendments:-

List of Attendees:-

That the name of Mark Algar is deleted and Graham Purdy is added to the list of those present at the meeting. That the surname of Philip Lewis is amended to Hewitson and his correct title of (Non-Executive Director NHS North Yorkshire & York) inserted.

Page 4 – penultimate paragraph “Philip Hewitson, accompanying Janet Probert .....” and not Dr Philip Lewis.

Page 8 – typographical error – fourth paragraph final line the word ‘now’ to replace ‘know’

Page 10 – typographical error – first bullet point – first line – delete the word ‘is’.

## **55. CHAIRMAN’S ANNOUNCEMENTS**

The Chairman drew Members attention to the tabled letter (copy placed in Minute Book) dated 27 October 2010 received from Andrew Lansley, Secretary of State for Health. The letter was in response to the referral of the Committee concerning closure of beds on the Ryedale Ward at Malton Community Hospital. The Chairman said that the matter was ongoing and undertook to keep the Committee fully informed.

## **56. PUBLIC QUESTIONS OR STATEMENTS**

No formal notice had been received.

### **RESOLVED**

That those Members of the public present at the meeting who wished to speak on items listed on the agenda would be invited to do so during consideration of the relevant item.

## **57. YORKSHIRE AMBULANCE SERVICE – DEVELOPMENTS ACROSS THE SERVICE AND SPECIFICALLY IN THE STOKESLEY AND GREAT AYTON AREAS**

CONSIDERED –

The introductory report of Bryon Hunter, Scrutiny Support Officer, including a copy of the Yorkshire Ambulance Service Monthly Update – October 2010.

The Committee received a power-point presentation from Vince Larvin, Director of A&E Operation, YAS and Helen Hugill, Service & Quality Improvement Manager, YAS (a copy of the slides is in the Minute Book). The presentation compared YAS’s performance in March 2010 to that during November 2010. Improvements introduced since March that had led to the Care Quality Commission lifting in September the condition it had imposed on YAS’s registration in April were highlighted. Response time data and future service challenges were also summarised. Vince Larvin emphasised that during the last year there had been a 6% increase in demand for the Service in North Yorkshire. This additional demand fell outside of the terms of the contract YAS had agreed with NHS North Yorkshire & York and was not replicated elsewhere in the country. He stressed to Members this was a significant factor and should not be forgotten when the performance of YAS was compared to the national standard.

The presentation also included an overview of new Service arrangements in Stokesley and Great Ayton and described in detail the action taken to improve performance with particular emphasis on the steps taken in Hambleton &

Richmondshire. The Committee noted the appointment of a task and finish group responsible for improving its Category A (emergency) response times.

In response to questions from Members, Vince Larvin said that the Service had plans to further increase the number of trained paramedic personnel notwithstanding that the current figure of 52% was already a high ratio. He added that over the course of the next six months spare vehicles would be transferred to the many single ambulance stations in Hambleton & Richmondshire area which he hoped would further improve response times. He was optimistic that response times in the most rural area Hambleton & Richmondshire would rise to over 60%. The Committee noted that this was still a long way short of the national target.

County Councillor Heather Moorhouse enquired about the condition of vehicles especially those used at Stokesley and whether they were fit for purpose. She said that she had visited the station at Stokesley and spoken to one of the drivers who had expressed concerns about the suitability of some of the vehicles. Vince Larvin replied that the age profile of fleet vehicles was diminishing and that additionally the strength of the fleet had been further improved with the addition of 4x4 resource so as to better cope with bad weather. The fleet comprised of a number of different vehicle types and invariably drivers each had their own preference. He accepted that some of vehicles did not give patients a quality experience but stressed that they were all legal and said that in eighteen months time the overhaul of the entire fleet would be complete.

District Councillor Bridget Fortune said that eighteen months ago when plans were announced about the new service arrangements in Stokesley and Great Ayton areas residents had been sceptical. However experience had shown that the current service was a definite improvement on the previous arrangements and she congratulated the staff concerned and asked for her comments to be relayed back to them. District Councillor Margaret Skillbeck agreed with the comments of Cllr Fortune and said that the service in Stokesley was much improved.

When asked about increased demand for the Service, Vince Larvin said that the Primary Care Trust was aware of the situation and negotiations were ongoing. YAS was equally aware of the financial constraints under which the PCT was operating and the introduction of GP commissioning meant that there would be interesting times ahead. He was unable to comment upon whether any additional funds would be forthcoming and said that roughly speaking a 1% increase in demand for the service equated to a 1% reduction in performance.

County Councillor John Blackie said that 6 years ago response times for CAT A calls in Hambleton & Richmondshire was 52%. Following the best efforts of the Task & Finish Group referred to in the presentation he did not consider the current figure of 59% to be adequate. Especially as in some areas of Hambleton & Richmondshire response times remained below 50%.

County Councillor Blackie went on to say that whilst he fully supported proposed changes to the care pathways of stroke and trauma patients as discussed at a previous meeting and the subject of the next agenda item, he would like an update on the position of the negotiations between the South Tees Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust and the Primary Care Trust regarding the provision of additional resource to YAS in order that the changes could be affected successfully. The Chairman said that this point would be addressed in the next agenda item. Finally County Councillor Blackie cited examples where poor communication between YAS and the air ambulance had led to several units being deployed to the same incident. This duplication had he said resulted in little or no cover then being available should another emergency arise in the locality. Councillor Blackie enquired what steps had been taken to address the problem.

Vince Larvin said that with regard to the air ambulance, following the introduction of new systems, communication channels had improved and duplicate units would be no longer sent out unnecessarily to the same incident. He readily agreed to send copies of minutes of meetings of the Task & Finish Group to the Scrutiny Support Officer following the meeting.

At the request of County Councillor John McCartney, Vince Larvin agreed to supply details of response times for ambulances in the Selby area as the area was covered by a different ambulance service and the data not included in the presentation.

County Councillor Shelagh Marshall said she was aware that the contract for the supply of vehicles used by the Patient Transport Service in Craven was about to be tendered. Concerns about the current vehicles being very old, uncomfortable and generally in poor condition had been raised by a number of parties and she asked if similar tendering exercises were planned for the rest of the county. The Chairman agreed to add to the Committee's work programme an examination of the Patient Transport Service.

The Chairman thanked Vince Larvin and Helen Hugill for their attendance and asked them to relay back to the relative parties the comments made during the meeting.

#### **RESOLVED –**

That Minutes of the Yorkshire Ambulance Service Task & Finish Group be sent to the Scrutiny Support Officer.

That the Scrutiny of Health Committee continues to monitor negotiations around service demand and provision of resource between Yorkshire Ambulance Service and NHS North Yorkshire & York.

That an examination of the Patient Transport Service be added to the Committee's Work Programme.

#### **58. ACUTE STROKE SERVICES AND TRAUMA AND ORTHOPAEDIC SURGERY PATHWAYS IN THE SOUTH TEES HOSPITALS NHS FOUNDATION TRUST – ENGAGEMENT PROCESS**

#### **CONSIDERED –**

The report of the Head of Scrutiny and Corporate Performance updating Members on feedback to date received by South Tees Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust from patients and the public on changes to stroke and trauma patient care pathways.

The Committee was addressed by Richmondshire District Councillor Tony Duff who expressed strong opposition to the changes on the grounds that they represented unreasonable centralisation. He said that publicity about the engagement process had been poor and that parish councils had not been given sufficient time to allow them to respond. He disputed that only a small number of patients would be affected and said that the increased distances would make hospital visiting very difficult especially for those using public transport. He added that the changes were reliant on additional ambulance resource being provided confirmation of which was still awaited.

The Chairman then invited Gill Moulton, Director of Planning (South Tees Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust) to present the details of feedback received to date on the proposals.

Gill Moulton introduced Appendix one of the report and said that since it had been circulated two further responses had been received. She said that the majority of comments received were in respect of stroke care and she confirmed that individual responses would be sent to all those who had contributed to the consultation. She confirmed that discussions on the additional ambulance resource required had taken place between the Primary Care Trust, South Tees Hospitals Foundation Trust and Yorkshire Ambulance Service.

Dr Paul McCann addressed the Committee and reassured Members that the changes would benefit patients and would improve the efficiency of theatre time. He repeated patient numbers were low and said there would be no reduction in bed numbers as a result of the changes at Friarage Hospital.

County Councillor John Blackie thanked Jill Moulton for agreeing to extend the consultation period and expressed his support for the proposed changes to patient care-pathways, whilst regretting the fact that the changes would in time move the Friarage Hospital closer to becoming an elected clinic. Given that the success of the proposals was dependent upon additional ambulance resource, he proposed that Jill Moulton be invited to attend the next meeting to report on confirmation of the availability of the necessary funding. He said that people in the Dales whilst welcoming the changes remained concerned about increased travel distances and the availability of ambulance resource.

On behalf of NY LINK Kath Murray expressed support for the proposals on the grounds of patient safety. She said that the LINK would closely monitor ambulance response times in Hambleton/Richmondshire where problems were already known to exist.

The Chairman thanked Jill Moulton and Dr McCann for their attendance and for their willingness to report interim consultation results.

#### **RESOLVED –**

That South Tees Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust be invited to attend the January 2010 meeting of the Committee to report the results of its engagement process on proposals to redesign stroke and trauma patient care pathways and whether additional ambulance resource has been secured.

That the Scrutiny of Health Committee recommends South Tees Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust to respond direct to Councillor Tony Duff and Leyburn Town Council regarding comments made at the meeting and submitted in response to the consultation.

#### **59. PROPOSALS FOR GP SERVICES AT THE BRANCH SURGERY IN CAWOOD, SELBY**

##### **CONSIDERED –**

The report of Bryon Hunter, Scrutiny Support Officer on the proposed closure of Cawood surgery and the transfer of services to the main Posterngate surgery in Selby. The main reason for the proposal was to centralise patient care and patient facilities at the main surgery. Appended to the report was a report from NHS North Yorkshire and York outlining the:-

- Reasons and background to the closure.
- Practice population.
- Condition of premises.

- Service provision.
- Stakeholder Engagement and Communication Plan.
- Timetable for Closure.

Members supported in principal the proposed closure on the grounds of the poor condition of the premises.

County Councillor Margaret Hulme complimented Lorraine Naylor on her comprehensive report and Selby District Councillor Kay McSherry expressed support for the proposals.

County Councillor Polly English referred to the timing of the public meeting and drop-in sessions and suggested that they be held at different times of the day so as to accommodate both elderly persons and people who worked. Lorraine Naylor agreed to her request.

In response to a question from County Councillor John Blackie, it was confirmed that both a public meeting as well as drop-in sessions would be arranged as part of the Stakeholder Engagement and Communication Plan.

#### **RESOLVED –**

That the results of the Stakeholder Engagement and Communication Plan for the closure of Cawood surgery and the transfer of services to Posterngate surgery in Selby be reported to the January meeting.

#### **60. DEVELOPMENTS IN GP SERVICES IN NORTH WEST HARROGATE**

**Harrogate District Councillor Ian Galloway declared a personal interest in the following item as he and members of his family are registered as patients at the surgery premises The Medical Centre, 80 Knaresborough Road, Harrogate.**

#### **CONSIDERED –**

The report of the Head of Scrutiny and Corporate Performance on the application of Dr Bannatyne and Partners to close one of their two branch surgeries at The Medical Centre, 80 Knaresborough Road, Harrogate. Appended to the report was a report from NHS North Yorkshire and York outlining the:-

- Reasons and background to the closure.
- Practice population.
- Condition of premises.
- Service provision.
- Stakeholder Engagement and Communication Plan.
- Timetable for Closure.

The Committee was advised that the practice currently operated from three sites and would like to streamline and rationalise their services across two sites. The premises at the Health Centre were not fit for purpose in spite of improvement carried out. The practice proposed to close the Medical Centre site and to expand and remodel premises at its main site at Church Road, Harrogate. The practice was hopeful that patients would relocate and travel the short distance (1.5miles) to the main site.

The report was introduced by Lorraine Naylor, Assist Director Primary Care NHS North Yorkshire and York and Jennifer Joyce, Practice Manager Bannatyne & Partners. They told the Committee that a lot of the patients at the practice already used all three sites. Those patients not willing to transfer would be able to register

with the remaining practice at the Medical Centre. As at the date of the meeting 29 responses to the consultation had been received. Of those 29, 9 people had stated they were not willing to relocate and would transfer to a new practice 13 said they had no problem with the proposal and 7 had been general enquiries.

County Councillor John Blackie commented that 29 responses from the total of 4,500 patients registered at the practice was not enough upon which to be able to gauge public response to the proposal. The premises at Church Road, Harrogate lacked car parking facilities and he was concerned that the withdrawal of the Bannatyne Practice from the Medical Centre could lead the Primary Care Trust to say that the premises were not fit for purpose. If this happened and the remaining practice at the Medical Centre withdrew from the premises then patients would be left potentially without access to primary GP services. For these reasons he suggested that the Committee defer making a decision until its meeting in January to enable the Committee to consider the results of the consultation. He also suggested that a public meeting was organised as part of the consultation.

Lorraine Naylor, stated that the Primary Care Trust had no plans to close the remaining practice at the Medical Centre. She confirmed that she was happy to organise a public meeting and said that there was adequate access to GP services in the locality. She confirmed that the Health Centre building was owned by the Primary Care Trust, but explained that she could give no assurances as to intentions for the building if and when anticipated legislative changes affecting the structure of the NHS removed the building from the PCT's ownership. This situation was unlikely to be resolved by January 2011 when the consultation was due to close.

District Councillor Ian Galloway, a registered patient at the Bannatyne Practice said that his only concern with the proposal related to the lack of parking at Church Road, Harrogate. He said that he had spoken to Highway Officers at the County Council about the problem as he felt it would only be a matter of time before residents in the surrounding streets complained and measures such as double yellow lines were introduced. Apart from the parking problem he had outlined Councillor Galloway said he supported the proposal and was happy to relocate to Church Road as it was easier for him to get to.

The Committee was informed that the practice intended to contact the Landlord of a local pub to ascertain if he would be willing for patients to use the pub's car park when visiting the surgery at Church Lane.

County Councillor Mike Knaggs said that he was reassured by the comments of Councillor Galloway and satisfied with the information provided at the meeting and in the report. Councillor Knaggs said it would be unreasonable for the Committee to insist on representatives from the practice and the primary care trust having to attend the January meeting to present the results of the public consultation, when this could quite easily be dealt via written correspondence. Councillor Knaggs did not agree with the suggestion that a public meeting be held as part of the consultation, again he considered it unnecessary.

It was proposed and seconded that the Committee recommend a public meeting be held during the consultation period and that the results of the consultation be referred to the January meeting at which representatives from the Bannatyne Practice and NHS North Yorkshire & York be invited to attend to give assurances about the continuation of the remaining practice at the Health Centre Premises. This motion was defeated.

A further motion was proposed and seconded that the Committee supports the closure of the Bannatyne & Partners GP branch surgery at The Medical Centre, 80 Knaresborough Road, Harrogate.

## **RESOLVED –**

That the Scrutiny of Health Committee supports the closure of the Bannatyne & Partners GP branch surgery at The Medical Centre, 80 Knaresborough Road, Harrogate.

**County Councillor John Blackie abstained from voting on the above item and asked for this to be recorded.**

## **61. WORK PROGRAMME REPORT**

### **CONSIDERED –**

The report of Bryon Hunter, Scrutiny Support Office inviting Members to comment on and approve the content of the Committee's future work programme.

The Scrutiny Support Officer said that the mid-cycle briefing meeting on 17 December 2010 at 10.30 am would instead be an informal workshop that would be open to all members of the Committee. The purpose of the workshop was to discuss the Primary Care Trust's budget and the implications of the White Paper. Jayne Brown, Chief Executive, NHS North Yorkshire & York had agreed to attend the workshop to talk about forthcoming structural changes in the NHS. All Members of the Committee were asked to make a note of the date in their diary.

The Chairman requested the Scrutiny Support Office submit a report to the January 2011 meeting on developments regarding the transfer of community services, the White Paper, Health Bill and other recently published documents that would impact upon healthcare provision and the role of the Committee.

County Councillor Shelagh Marshall agreed to present a report on the recently published Equalities Bill and on the changing attitude to language used in connection with older people.

County Councillor Polly English reported that as a Member of Craven District Council's Task Group for Vascular Services she was due to attend the first meeting of the Group on 30 November. She said that she would report back the outcome of that meeting to the January 2011 meeting of the Committee.

County Councillor John Blackie requested that an item on the GP Out of Hours Service be added to the Work Programme and that it include reference to service changes at Catterick Garrison. District Councillor Rob Johnson said he had been approached by GP's with issues about the Out of Hours Service.

County Councillor John Clark reminded the Committee that a report on the outcome of the Community Nursing Pilot in Malton had been agreed at the previous meeting as had visits Malton and Whitby Hospitals.

## **RESOLVED –**

That the content of the Work Programme be agreed and that the items requested during the meeting referred to in the Minutes be added.

JW/ALJ